Pruceti Theol. Sea. a change of the Complements

THE TESTIMONY

OF

## JUSTIN MARTYR

TO

## EARLY CHRISTIANITY.

## LECTURES

Delivered on the L. P. Stone Foundation at Princeton Theological Seminary, in March, 1888.

BY

GEORGE T. PURVES, D.D.,

PASTOR OF THE PIRST PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH OF PITTSBURGH, PA.

1889

NEW YORK:

ANSON D. F. RANDOLPH AND COMPANY,

38 WEST TWENTY-THIRD STREET.

panes marrolle de lichères villais le low ally fould en die George d' Morie in le de leur equal y mention de le pres co far an the mere vording in conseinad. Data ly frence marrolle de marrolle de le m

We have next to examine Justin's account of Christ's life and teaching as it is disclosed by the statements scattered through his writings and compare it with the accounts given by the Synoptical Gospels

Summarizing the results of such an examination we discover -

- (L) That his account of the Air of Them is removedably fall. We bear from him Christ's divid from the Tir-
- I The number of Zadedee's sons Equipment. In the enverounal George of Europe, see Washer's Canon, p. 99, now 1: Fisher's The Supermounal Orbits of Christianing p. 185.
- I Age to the change the release has be present an equition to us to develope in example, and manifely to the fractions as West-com respects Change to III have I'v Justin had in immi Land to the Acts to I.
  - ACLAS CI-CONSTILLORS
- 4 Ch Westeem's Chain, on W-R. Simber's Pespels in the Second Century, 3th 97-38; Characte's Charactery, for similar symmetries.

gin,<sup>1</sup> and the events of His infancy;<sup>2</sup> His waiting in obscurity "until about thirty years of age;" the mission of John the Baptist,<sup>4</sup> together with the baptism and temptation of Jesus; the characteristic features of Christ's teaching; the fact and variety of His miracles; quotations from or references to the accounts of the healing of the centurion's servant and Matthew's feast; the choosing of the Twelve; the naming of Zebedee's sons; the commission of the Apostles; the discourse after the departure of John's messengers; the sign of the prophet Jonas; the parable of the Sower; the confession

- <sup>1</sup> Cf. Ap. i. 21, 22, 32, 33, 46; Dial. 43, 66, 75, 76, 84, 100.
- <sup>2</sup> Born under Cyrenius, one hundred and fifty years ago (Ap. i. 46); visit of Magi; annunciation to Joseph; journey to Bethlehem at the time of the census; Jesus born in a cave near Bethlehem; laid in a manger, where the Magi found Him; flight to Egypt; massacre of the children in Bethlehem by Herod (Dial. 78, 102); the star of the Magi (Dial. 106); the circumcision (Dial. 67).
- <sup>3</sup> Dial. 88 ("He grew up like other men, and waited thirty years more or less till John appeared").
- <sup>4</sup> John, the last of the Jewish prophets; Matt. iii. 11, 12, quoted; John imprisoned and beheaded by Herod (Dial. 49); Christ ended John's ministry (Dial. 51); John, the herald of Christ (Dial. 88).
  - <sup>5</sup> Dial. 88.
- <sup>6</sup> Dial. 103, 125.
- <sup>7</sup> Brief and concise utterances (Ap. i. 14); power of His word, by which He confuted the Scribes and Pharisees (Dial. 102).
- <sup>8</sup> Dial. 49; Ap. i. 22 (healed the lame and paralytic and blind from birth (ἐκ γενετῆς πονηρούς; cf. below, p. 185), and raised the dead). So Ap. i. 30, 31, 48; Dial. 69.
- <sup>9</sup> Dial. 76, 120, 140 ("Many shall come from the East and West," etc.).
  - <sup>10</sup> Ap. i. 15 ("I came not to call the righteous," etc.).
  - <sup>11</sup> Ap. i. 39; Dial. 42.

- <sup>12</sup> Dial. 106.
- 18 Ap. i. 16, 19, 63; Dial. 35, 82.
- <sup>14</sup> Ap. i. 63; Dial. 51, 100, 106.
- <sup>15</sup> Dial. 107.

16 Dial. 125.

of Peter; the announcement of the Passion; while of the later period, and especially the last week of Christ's life, and of the events which immediately followed the resurrection, Justin speaks with still greater fulness. In fact, we may obtain from him passages which correspond in substance to portions of every chapter of Matthew's Gospel, and sometimes to portions of considerable size; also to portions of all but seven of the chapters of Luke's Gospel. The evidence, therefore, upon which to base a comparison of Justin's account of Christ's life with that of the Synoptists is larger than might have been expected, and sufficient to yield positive results.

(2) Now, with the exception of a few items to be mentioned presently, Justin's account of Christ's life agrees in

<sup>1</sup> Dial. 100. <sup>2</sup> Dial. 51, 106.

- <sup>8</sup> We find references to, or quotations from, the triumphal entry (Ap. i. 35; Dial. 53); the second cleansing of the temple (Dial. 17, "My house shall be called a house of prayer," etc.); the tribute money (Ap. i. 17); the two commandments (Dial. 93); the rebukes of the Pharisees (Dial. 17, 95, 112, 122); the discourse on the Mount of Olives (Ap. 1. 16, 28; Dial. 35, 51, 76, 82, 116, 125); the institution of the Supper (Ap. i. 66); the agony (Dial. 99, 103); the trial before the Sanhedrim (Dial. 103); Christ's silence at His trial (Dial. 102, 103); Pilate's sending Him to Herod (Dial. 103); His crucifixion under Pontius Pilate (Ap. i. 13, 35; ii. 6; Dial. 30, 85); the parting of His garments (Ap. i. 35; Dial. 97, 103); the mockery of the Jews (Dial. 101); the ery on the Cross (Dial. 99); the resurrection on the first day of the week (Ap. i. 67; Dial. 41); the report of the Jews that Christ's body was stolen (Dial. 108); His last commission (Ap. i. 31, Apostles sent to all nations; 61, baptism in the name of the Trinity); and His ascension (Ap. i. 21).
- <sup>4</sup> As, e. g., Matt. ii. 5, 6, 11-23 (Ap. i. 34; Dial. 78, 103); v. 16, 20, 22, 28, 29, 32, 34, 37, 39, 40-42, 44-46 (Ap. i. 1, 15, 16; Dial. 85, 96, 105, 133); xxiii. 6, 7, 13, 15, 16, 23, 24, 27, 31 (Dial. 17, 95, 112, 122).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Cf. Otto's Justini Opera, tom. i. index iii.

substance and so far as the events narrated are con(2) Agrees, cerned precisely with the account given by our
with a few exceptions, substantially with that of
our Gospels. His language is not always identical with theirs, as we shall see;
our Gospels. but his story is, with a few trifling exceptions, exactly the same as theirs: so that we may already affirm that if his "memoirs" were not our Gospels, they at least related substantially the same story
of Christ's life.

(3) Furthermore, the agreement between Justin's account taken from the "memoirs" with that of our Gospels often extends to small particulars, (3) The agreement which are the more significant because of extends to their very smallness. Thus his account of small particulars. Christ's infancy, unlike that given in the early apocrypha, is identical with that of our Gospels, save that he states that Christ was born in a cave near Bethlehem, and that the Magi were from Arabia. He refers to the enrolment under Cyrenius.<sup>2</sup> He speaks of Christ's natural growth from infancy to manhood,3 and says that at His baptism He was thirty years old, "more or less." 4 So the naming of the sons of Zebedce,<sup>5</sup> Christ's silence at His trial, Pilate's sending Him to Herod, and the Jews' story that He was stolen from the tomb by His disciples,8 are examples of the slight

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Dial. 78.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Ap. i. 34, 46. When he appeals (Ap. i. 34) to the "registers which were made under Cyrenius" (τῶν ἀπογραφῶν τῶν γενομένων ἐπὶ Κυρηνίου) for proof that "there is a certain village in the land of the Jews, thirty-five stadia from Jerusalem, in which Jesus Christ was born," he probably merely takes for granted that such registers had been preserved by the Government. So when he appeals to the "Acta Pilati" (i. 35, 48).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Dial. 88.

<sup>4</sup> Cf. ωσεί, Luke iii. 23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Dial. 106.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Dial. 102, 103.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Dial. 103.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Dial. 108.

coincidences in matters of fact which continually occur in the accounts of Justin and the Synoptists.

- (4) The differences between the two accounts are the following. Justin says that Cyrenius was the first procurator of Judæa; that Joseph was of Beth- (4) The lehem; 3 that Jesus was born in a cave near differences from our Bethlehem; that the Magi were from Ara-Gospels.
- <sup>1</sup> It is hardly fair with Sanday (Gospels in the Second Century, p. 91) to infer from the fact that Justin derives Christ's Davidic descent through Mary (Ap. i. 32; Dial. 100, 120), that he had a genealogy of Christ different from those of Matthew and Luke; for he may have understood one or both of these to give Mary's pedigree. Clement of Alexandria (Strom. i. 21, quoted by Westcott's Canon, p. 91, note 1, though Westcott goes too far in saying that Clement "distinctly refers the genealogy to Mary") apparently understood even Matthew to give Mary's pedigree (if not her lineal, at least her legal, pedigree). Her Davidic descent, which may be defended from Acts ii. 30; Rom. i. 3; Luke i. 32, was universally believed in the early Church (cf. Andrew's Life of Our Lord, p. 52); and while the explanation of the Gospel genealogies adopted by Africanus (Eus. H. E. i. 7) referred both to Joseph, Mary was supposed and is expressly said by Africanus to have been of the same tribe. Justin refers to none of Mary's ancestors later than David, and mentions as her ancestors, David, Jesse, Phares, Judah, Jacob, Isaac, and Abraham, all which names occur in both Matthew and Luke, while his reference to Adam as the ancestor of these patriarchs, in giving his reason why Christ called himself the Son of Man (Dial. 100), points to Luke iii. 38. Of the course of descent from David to Mary, Justin is silent.

<sup>2</sup> Ap. i. 34. ἐπιτρόπου. Cyrenius, whatever his precise office, was not the first "governor." Luke ii. 2, has αὖτη ἀπογραφὴ πρώτη ἐγένετο ἡγεμονεύοντος τῆς Συρίας Κυρηνίου.

3 Dial. 78. "He went up from Nazareth, where he dwelt, to Bethlehem, ὅθεν ἦν." This is obviously a reference to Luke ii. 4: "διὰ τὸ εἶναι αὐτὸν ἐξ οἴκου καὶ πατριᾶς Δαυείδ;" but the fact is stated by Justin so as to apparently imply that Joseph had lived in Bethlehem previously.

<sup>4</sup> Dial. 78. "Since he could not find lodging in the village." Caves were often used as stables, and Justin says the Magi found Jesus laid in a manger.

bia; and that Jesus was deformed, or not of comely aspect, as had been predicted. He speaks of John the Baptist "sitting" by the Jordan, and states that when Jesus went down to the water to be baptized, a fire was kindled in the Jordan, and that the Voice from heaven

- <sup>1</sup> Dial. 78. Sanday (Gospels in the Second Century, p. 93) makes Justin say that Herod "ordered a massacre of all the children in Bethlehem." So he does in Dial. 78; but in Dial. 103, he says that Herod, "when He [Christ] was born, slew all the children born in Bethlehem about that time (ἐκείνου τοῦ καιροῦ);" cf. Matt. ii. 16, "from two years old and under."
- <sup>2</sup> Dial. 14, 49, 85, 88, 100, 110, 121, referring to Isa. liii. 2, 3.  $d\epsilon\iota\delta\dot{\eta}s$ .
  - 3 Dial. 51, 88. καθεζομένου.
- <sup>4</sup> Dial. 88. κατελθόντος τοῦ Ἰησοῦ ἐπὶ τὸ ὕδωρ καὶ πῦρ ἀνήφθη ἐν τῷ Ἰορδάνη. Cf. Otto, sub loco. The same legend was found in the Predicatio Pauli by the author of the tract De Rebaptismate (ascribed by some to Ursinus, a monk of the fourth century; by others to Cyprian. Cf. Ante-Nie. Fathers, Amer. ed. v. 665), "cum baptizaretur, ignem super aquam esse visum." In the Gospel of the Ebionites (according to Epiphanius, Hær. xxx. 13), when Jesus came up from the water a great light (φῶς) shone round the place (περιέλαμψε τὸν τόπον); and the old Latin Codex a (Vercellensis) adds to Matt. iii. 15, "et cum baptizaretur lumen ingens circumfulsit de aqua ita ut timerent omnes qui advenerant" (cf. Sanday, Ibid., p. 108. He adds that there is a similar addition in g' (San Germanensis)). Otto also cites Oracc. Sibyll. vii. 82–84:—

"Ως σε λόγον γέννησε πατήρ, πνεθμ" δρνιν ἀφήκε, 'Οξύν ἀπαγγελτήρα λόγων, λόγος, ϋδασιν ἀγνοῖς 'Ραίνων σὸν βάπτισμα, δι' οῦ πυρὸς έξεφαάνθης,

and the Liturgy of the Syrians, which, in the narrative of the baptism, has "quo tempore adscendit ab aquis, sol inclinavit radios suos." In this last case we may perhaps see the original form of the legend. Justin does not say that the "memoirs" related this legend. His language is, "When Jesus had gone to the river Jordan, where John was baptizing, and when He had stepped into the water, a fire was kindled in the Jordan; and the Apostles of this very Christ of ours wrote that when He came out of

which followed the baptism repeated the words of the Second Psalm, "Thou art my Son; this day have I begotten thee." He states that Christ healed those who "from birth were blind, dumb, and lame," but

the water the Holy Spirit as a dove lighted on Him." Thus he carefully makes the "memoirs" responsible only for the descent of the Spirit as a dove.

1 Dial. 88, 103. These words are found in Luke iii. 22, according to D. and lat. mss. a, b, c, ff 1. The Gospel of the Ebionites (Epiphan. xxx. 13) had "Thou art my beloved Son; in Thee I am well pleased. And again, To-day I have begotten Thee." The words of the Psalm are referred to the baptism by Clement of Alexandria (Pædag. i. 6); Methodius (Conviv. virgg. Discourse viii. ch. 9); Lactantius (Instt. Div. iv. 15); Juvencus (Hist. Ev. i. 363); and Augustine (Enchiridion, c. 49). (Cf. Otto, sub Dial. 88, where the quotations are given. He also refers to Acta Petri et Pauli, c. 29; but there seems in that place to be no reference of the words to the baptism.) Augustine, however (Harmony of the Gospels, ii. 14) says the reading was found in some codices of Luke, but was said not to be found in the more ancient codices. Either Justin's manuscript had this Western corruption, or he had heard it thus quoted and relied on his memory.

<sup>2</sup> Ap. i. 22. Our Gospels contain no examples of the healing of those dumb or lame from birth. The manuscripts of Justin read "χωλούς καὶ παραλυτικούς καὶ έκ γενετής πονηρούς." Most editions substitute for πονηρούς πηρούς, following Dial. 69, where we read, "τούς έκ γενετής και κατά την σάρκα πηρούς και κωφούς και χωλούς ιάσατο, του μέν άλλεσθαι, του δέ και ακούειν, του δὲ καὶ ὁρᾶν τῷ λόγω αὐτοῦ ποιήσας." In Ap. i. 22, Gildersleeve substitutes ἀναπήρους. Whatever the reading, it should be noted that Justin connects ek yeverns only with movnpoùs in Ap. i. 22, and chiefly with mppoùs in Dial. 69; and from the latter passage it is clear that Justin meant by  $\pi\eta\rho\sigma\dot{\nu}s$  (and therefore probably in Ap. i. 22 by  $\pi o \nu \eta \rho o \nu s = \text{suffering}$ , the blind. Hence I infer he had in mind John ix. 1, and that he includes the dumb and lame by a pardonable inexactness of statement. In Mark ix. 21, however, the "lunatic" boy is said to have been afflicted ἐκ παιδιόθεν. Could Justin have had in mind, also, Acts iii. 2, and confused it with Christ's miracles?

that the Jews ascribed these miracles to magic; 1 also that the ass's colt used at the triumphal entry was found by the disciples "bound to a vine at the entrance of a village." He cites from the "memoirs" that in Gethsemane Christ's sweat fell like drops when He was praying; that the Jews came upon Christ "from the Mount of Olives," 4 and that there was not a man to aid Him.<sup>5</sup> Pilate sent Him bound to Herod as a compliment; 6 and Justin apparently represents Herod Antipas as a successor of Archelaus in the dominion of Herod the Great. He says that His persecutors placed Christ on the judgment-seat, and said, "Judge us;" 8 and that at the crucifixion the

<sup>1</sup> Dial. 69. καὶ γὰρ μάγον εἶναι αὐτὸν ἐτόλμων λέγειν καὶ λαοπλάνον. In Clem. Recog. i. 58, a scribe declares that Christ performed "signa et prodigia ut magus non ut propheta." So in the report of Pilate, incorporated in the Acts of Peter and Paul, we read that the Jews asserted Jesus "magum esse et contra eorum legem agere." In Ap. i. 30, Justin undertakes to prove that Christ did not do miracles μαγική τέχνη. Celsus (Orig. contra Cels. ii. 48) attributed them to sorcery. This charge was, in fact, substantially the same with that mentioned in the Gospels (Matt. ix. 34; xi. 24, etc.), that he cast out devils by Beelzebub. For λαοπλάνον, see Matt. xxvii. 63 and John vii. 12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Ap. i. 32.

<sup>8</sup> Dial. 103. Justin significantly cites it "from the memoirs, which I say were composed by the Apostles and their followers;" thus no doubt referring the story to Luke's Gospel. On the spuriousness, however, of Luke xxii. 43, 44, see Notes on Select Readings in Westcott and Hort's Greek Testament; and on the bearing of Justin's text on the age of the Gospels, see below. Justin, however, has only θρόμβοι, not θρόμβοι αίματος. Tatian, in his Diatessaron, had the passage, which is translated by Mossinger from Ephraem's Commentary, "et factus est sudor ejus ut guttæ sanguinis."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Dial. 103.  $d\pi \delta$ .

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Dial. 103.

<sup>6</sup> Dial. 103. χαριζόμενος.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Dial. 103.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Ap. i. 35. κρίνον ήμίν.

mocking bystanders not only shook their heads and shot out their lips, but "twisted their noses to each other," and cried, "Let Him who raised the dead deliver Himself;" and "He called Himself Son of God; let Him come down and walk; let God save Him." After He was crucified, all His acquaintances forsook Him, having denied Him. To these items are to be added two sayings of Christ's, reported by Justin, but not found in our Gospels. These are, "In whatsoever things I take you, in these will I also judge;" and "There shall be schisms and heresies." But with these we have enumerated all the substantial

- <sup>1</sup> Ap. i. 38; Dial. 101.
- <sup>2</sup> Dial. 103. τοις μυξωτήρσιν έν αλλήλοις διαρρινούν.
- 8 Ap. i. 38. ὁ νεκρούς ἀνεγείρας ῥυσάσθω ἐαυτόν.
- <sup>4</sup> Dial. 103. <sup>5</sup> Ap. i. 50.
- 6 Dial. 47. Διὸ καὶ ὁ ἡμέτερος κύριος Ί. Χ. εἶπεν. Ἐν οἷς αν ύμας καταλάβω, εν τούτοις καὶ κρινώ. We find this nowhere else attributed to Christ. Clement of Alexandria (Quis Div. Salv. c. 40) quotes it, with a slight variation of text, without indicating its source. Otto refers to Hippolytus (Περὶ τῆς τοῦ παντὸς αἰτίας, 2) "whatever manner of persons they [were when they] lived without faith, as such they shall be faithfully judged" (Ante-Nic. Fathers, Amer. trans. v. 222); but Hippolytus seems merely to state a similar idea. By John Climachus (died 606), it was attributed to Ezekiel (cf. Otto). Apocryphal or interpolated writings of Ezekiel were known in the early Church; and J. B. Lightfoot (Clem. Rom. ad Cor. viii. note 12) supposes that Justin obtained it from that source, and from lapse of memory ascribed it to Christ, perhaps confusing it with John v. 30. Others (Grabe, Credner, etc.) suppose that Justin obtained it from the Gospel according to the Hebrews. Others consider it an inaccurate quotation of John v. 30, or Matt. xxiv. 30, and xxv. 1, etc.; or an oral tradition; or perhaps a gloss (Otto), summarizing these passages.
- <sup>7</sup> Dial. 35. Justin cites, as words of Christ, ἔσονται σχίσματα καὶ αἰρέσεις." Cf. 1 Cor. xi. 18, 19. The sentence is found nowhere else attributed to Christ; but similar summaries to the same effect are numerous. Cf. Tertullian, Clement of Alexandria, Clem. Recog., quoted by Otto.

differences between Justin's account of Christ's life and that of the canonical Gospels.<sup>1</sup>

If, then, we review these items, it must be evident that in comparison with the large amount of agreement between Justin and the canonical Gospels, The differthe differences are most trifling. It is to be ences are triding, noted, moreover, that for none of the points in which he differs from our Gospels, except the "bloody sweat," does Justin cite the authority of and not cited the "memoirs." Indeed, he seems carefully from the "memoirs," to avoid doing so, as may be seen in his account of the baptism, where, while relating that a fire

<sup>1</sup> Justin (Dial. 88) states that Jesus was a carpenter by trade, and made "ploughs and yokes by which He taught the symbols of righteousness and an active life." Mark vi. 3, however, according to the correct text, reads σὐχ οὖτός ἐστιν ὁ τέκτων; The tradition that He made ploughs and yokes evidently grew, as Justin's own language shows, from the desire to exhibit the symbolical import of His work. In Dial. 51, he says that Christ came and put an end to (ἔπαυσε) John's preaching and baptizing. But this can hardly be called a divergence from our Gospels; for though John did not immediately cease working after Christ's baptism, yet Christ did not enter on His Galilean ministry till John was imprisoned. Cf. Luke iii. 19, 20; John iii. 26-30. Dr. Sanday says (Gospels in the Second Century, p. 98): "There is nothing in Justin (as in Luke xxiv.) to show that the ascension did not take place on the same day as the resurrection." But neither is there anything in either Luke or Justin to show that it did; and Justin speaks of Christ's instructing the disciples in the true meaning of the Old Testament after His resurrection (Ap. i. 50; Dial. 106), which would seem to imply that some time elapsed between the resurrection and the ascension. In Dial. 35, Justin makes Christ say, "Many false Christs and false apostles shall arise;" and in Dial. 51, that He preached, "saying that the kingdom of heaven is at hand and that He must . . . be crucified, and on the third day rise again, and would appear again in Jerusalem and would eat and drink with His disciples;" but these passages are so easily explained as amplifications of the statements of our Gospels that they can scarcely be cited as extra-canonical sayings.