

FURTHER RESEARCHES

INTO THE

HISTORY OF THE

FERRAR-GROUP

BY

J. RENDEL HARRIS, M.A.

FELLOW OF CLARE COLLEGE, CAMBRIDGE.

LONDON:

C. J. CLAY AND SONS,
CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS WAREHOUSE,
AVE MARIA LANE.

1900

[All Rights reserved.]

Digitized by Google

P R E F A C E.

MR PEPYS tells us in his diary that he was waked one morning between four and five by a blackbird which he had purchased, which whistled as well as ever he heard any ; only it was 'the beginning of many tunes very well, but there leaves them and goes no further.' I am afraid that my writings on the text of the New Testament have the defect which Mr Pepys found in his blackbird's song ; they do not beat their music out, and they always stop short before the problems stated are properly solved. The present volume is certainly a case in point, and my fear is that, through its incompleteness, it may irritate rather than please. But if life should happen to be prolonged (which is itself the preliminary piping of a bird of passage), I shall hope to return to the Ferrar problem again and perhaps, with the aid of my friend, Mr Lake, who is busy with the same researches, to finally edit and explain the archetypal text which underlies this curious group of manuscripts.

RENDEL HARRIS.

INTRODUCTION.

IN the present tract I return to the study of a conspicuous group of New Testament MSS., marked by peculiar features of the highest interest, and containing a text widely divergent from any accepted or canonical form, known amongst scholars by the name of the Ferrar-group, a title of identification for all MSS. which show textual parallelism with the first members assigned to the group, a title also of honour for the scholar who first engaged in the task of reconstructing the original from which the various members of the group are descended.

Since the problems involved in the text and history of the Ferrar-group were first opened by the Dublin scholars (Ferrar and his literary executor Abbott), New Testament Criticism has made great advances on all sides: the copies are becoming better known, the versions which render the text and the fathers who quote it are receiving a more scientific treatment; activity rules all along the line, and even the reactionary critics, who are at their wits' ends to establish what they consider to be a Catholic text, have, by their zeal, contributed largely to that increase of knowledge which must, in the end, result in the demolition of the fetish which they worship. But nowhere has the activity been more conspicuous than in the study of what is called the Western text, to which the Ferrar-group contributes so much support. After the Codex Bezae, it may be doubted whether any Greek text is so important to the student as that lost archetype from which the members of the Ferrar-group depend, and which is capable of a restoration out of the evidence which is furnished by the individual members of the group.

For this reason we do not consider that the time and pains, which have been expended by other scholars as well as ourselves in the elucidation of this group, have been lost. Here, if anywhere, we can verify the importance of Dr Hort's canon, that "all trustworthy restoration of corrupted texts is founded on the study of their history"; for this group has a history which, with some lacunae, as is inevitable in all history, can be written out with definiteness and clearness, and almost all the peculiar readings furnished by the group will be traced before long to their ultimate source and have their final and complete explanation.

The first thing for us to do is to survey the field of study, and examine what points have been reached by the investigators. The bibliography of the investigation is something as follows. We start with Ferrar and Abbott, whose work is entitled *A collation of Four Important Manuscripts of the Gospels*, which appeared at Dublin, in 1877, after the death of Professor Ferrar.

The next stage is the Abbé Martin's epoch-making tract, entitled *Quatre Manuscrits Importants du Nouveau Testament, auxquels on peut en ajouter un cinquième*, which appears in 1886 as a reprint from the *Revue des Sciences Ecclésiastiques*¹. The value of this tract lies in the proof which it furnished that three out of four of the Ferrar-group could be definitely traced to South Italy or Sicily, and in the intimation that the group could be expanded by the addition of fresh members, more or less closely related to the main line of transmission of the Ferrar-text. The group which consisted originally of Ferrar's four, scattered over the wide area represented by England, France, Italy and Austria, has now undergone a geographical limitation to Calabria or Sicily, while at the same time it experiences an expansion numerically by the addition of hitherto unrecognized relatives to the family. Ferrar had started with the following MSS. in constituting his group, and reconstructing their archetype: Cod. Evv. 13 in the Bibliothèque Nationale at Paris, Cod. 69 in possession of the borough of Leicester in England, Cod. 124 in the Imperial Library at Vienna, and Cod. 346 in the Ambrosian Library at Milan. The

¹ Paris, Maisonneuve et C^o.

Digitized by Google
 Source: https://www.industrydocuments.ucsf.edu/docs/000000

three whose Calabrian affinities were successfully demonstrated by the Abbé Martin were 13, 124, and 346. To these he added Cod. 348, also at Milan, a not very close ally of the group¹, and intimated that Dr Scrivener had drawn his attention to a MS. coinciding in all respects with the Ferrar tradition, which was to be found in a collection of MSS. purchased at Janina in Epirus for the Baroness Burdett-Coutts. This MS., which Scrivener denoted by the number 556, but which Gregory marks as 543, will turn out to be a most important addition to the historical knowledge of the group. As it comes from a geographical centre so little removed from Calabria or Sicily, we might almost assume it to be South Italian in its origin, on the ground of its coincidence with the first four Ferrars; but it is sufficient, for the present, to remark that there is no need to change the geographical description of the group, from Calabro-Sicilian to any wider term, until we have examined the new member and made him tell his own story. Up to this point, then, the group is marked in New Testament symbols as

13—69—124—346—543,

and has attached to it the epithet Calabro-Sicilian on the ground of locations made for 13—124—346—[543]: the brackets denoting a partial or doubtful coincidence of origin.

The Abbé also expressed suspicions that a Graeco-Arabic MS. at Venice (Cod. Evv. 211) was in some way connected with the Ferrar-group. These suspicions were provoked by the existence of appended matter similar to what we find in Cod. 69 and Cod. 346. But he did not carry the enquiry beyond the point of speculation.

The next stage in the investigation is the publication in the year 1887 of my own work on *The Origin of the Leicester Codex of the New Testament*². The object of this work was to determine whether the youngest member of the Ferrar-group, the celebrated Leicester Codex (Cod. Evv. 69), could be geographically located

¹ Mr Lake, to whose studies in this field we shall presently draw attention, tells me that it is not a Ferrar-text, and that the Abbé Martin is mistaken in his assumption

of consanguinity between 348 and the group 13—124—346.

² London: C. J. Clay and Sons.

in the same way as had been done by the Abbé Martin for the other members of the group. I was able to show that the MS. had at one time been in the possession of the Convent of the Grey Friars at Cambridge, and although I was not able to carry the investigation much further, there were a number of palaeographical straws in the breeze which led me to conclude my enquiry in favour of an ultimate Italian origin in the following words:

"There is reason to believe that before the Leicester Codex came into the possession of the Cambridge Franciscans, it was to be found upon Italian soil; for there is a suspicion derived from the handwriting, from the vellum-paper arrangement in the quires, and from the paper-mark, which seems to indicate that it is an Italian production not half a century anterior to the invention of printing; but it must be remembered that this conclusion is not of as great a probable weight, in the matter of the reasonings upon which it is based, as the arguments by which we referred the book to Franciscan hands. If, however, our conclusion be valid we shall probably some day discover the ancestor of the MS. in some one of the Italian libraries."

We shall in the following pages resume the investigation, with a view to deciding some at least of the questions which are thus raised.

The next step in the solution of the Ferrar problem should perhaps be found in the publication in 1890 of that part of Dr Gregory's *Prolegomena to Tischendorf* which deals with the Catalogue of the cursive MSS. of the Gospels. Dr Gregory is careful to note the occurrence in the MSS. which he examines of any of those peculiarities, either in the text or in the supplementary matter, which are characteristic of the Ferrar-group or of any of its leading members. For example, he describes the MS. Evv. 543, to which we alluded above, in the following manner:

543. Lond. Burdett-Coutts iii. 5.

Saec. xii., 28.5 x 22.5, membr., foll. ?, coll. 2, ll. 27—30; capp. t, capp, titl, sect, can, lect, syn, men, subscr, *ρήμ, στίχ*: *Evv*; Mt Mc *ἐκ τοῦ κατὰ*; desunt Mt 12, 11—13, 10 Mc 8, 4—28 Lc 15, 20—16, 9 Joh 2, 22—4, 6 4, 52—5, 43 11, 21—47; insunt nonnulla de patriarchatibus etc., e familia Evv. 13. 69. 124. 346 esse videtur (cf. Evv. 13).

In this description there are a number of points registered

Downloaded from 201.129.252.211 on Tue, 20 Jun 2017 12:00:00 UTC by University of Cambridge. All rights reserved. http://www.jstor.org/terms

which are pure Ferrarisms, or which are shared by the Ferrar-group with a few other MSS. Such are the enumeration of the *ῥήματα* and the *στίχοι* contained in the separate books, the description of the gospels as *ἐκ τοῦ κατὰ Ματθαίου*, &c.; the peculiar tract on the limits of the patriarchates, which is also a feature of the Leicester and Milan MSS. By the registration of these peculiarities the student is directed in his search after other members of the family which he is engaged on. The same thing is the case when Gregory notes definite traces of Calabrian or S. Italian peculiarities, either in the hands or in the notes of ownership. Sometimes he actually draws the conclusion that the MS. in question belongs to the Ferrar-group, as in the case of Evv. 788 in the National Library at Athens; in other cases he furnishes the data upon which the student can build his own super-structure. It was certain that the publication of such an excellent catalogue of the MSS. of the New Testament would be the starting point for a great deal of further investigation into the history of the text¹.

The next step in the investigation is my lecture *On the Origin of the Ferrar-group*, delivered on Nov. 6th, 1893, at Mansfield College, Oxford².

In this tract a very important point was gained for the elucidation of the Ferrar origins, by an examination into the meaning of the two counts of *ῥήματα* and of *στίχοι* in the separate Gospels.

It was shown that the *ῥήματα* were a literal translation of the Syriac word *ܩܘܪܝܢܐ*, which means *verses*, so that we had the

¹ There is an illustration of this in the account of certain MSS. at Grotta Ferrata. Thus in describing Cod. Evv. 826, Gregory notes

Adult (i.e. pericope de adultera) sequitur Lc. 21, 38; videtur esse familiae Evv. 13 et Codici 69 simillimus. In Calabria exaratus. V. cl. Guil. Henr. Simcoxius me suadente maiorem Lucae partem, Apr. 1886, amicissime contulit et consanguinitatem cum illa familia detexit.

I do not think this partial collation was ever published: it is important to note that it adds another member to the group.

Mr. K. Lake, to whose work on this MS. we shall presently refer, points out that Gregory omits to notice that this MS. has the *ῥήματα* reckoned as well as the *στίχοι*, and also that the peculiar description of the Gospel as *ἐκ τοῦ κατὰ Ματθαίου* is found.

² London: C. J. Clay and Sons.

verses counted twice, once from the Greek as *στίχοι*, and once from the Syriac, which had itself derived its reckoning from the Greek. The way being thus opened for the recognition of the existence of a Syriac element in the MSS. in question, it was further suggested that a number of readings in the Ferrar-text might be explained by the influence of Tatian and his Diatessaron. The importance of these considerations for the right understanding of the story of the text is certainly very great.

In the same year 1893 was published posthumously the *Adversaria Critica* of Dr Scrivener. The importance of this work for the Ferrar problem consists in the fact that it contains a detailed description of Cod. 543 (Scrivener's 556) and a collation of it with the four MSS. of Ferrar. We shall use this description and collation in our further enquiry.

From 1893 the study seems to have dropped until 1898 when it was taken up by my friend Mr Lake, of Lincoln College, Oxford, who took the pains to examine a number of Italian MSS. that had been suspected of affinity with the Ferrar-group. The results of his investigation are published in the *Journal of Theol. Studies*, vol. 1. pp. 117—120. The first MS. examined by him is the MS. Evv. 211 at Venice, the Graeco-Arabic MS. to which we have alluded above. Mr Lake finds "that there seems little reason for doubting the accuracy of the Abbé Martin's suggestion that 211 was written in Calabria or Sicily, by either an Arabic scribe, or some writer or writers who were interested in Arab settlers in that district." He finds further that the text of the MS. does not supply many coincidences with the Ferrar-text, and suggests finally that "the verdict on 211 must therefore be that in all probability it represents two scribes, one a Calabrian Greek, the other a North African, who adopted much of the additional matter frequently connected with the Ferrar-text as well as the reckoning of the *ρήματα*. There is a somewhat less degree of probability for supposing that he knew the Ferrar-text, but only used it in the *pericope adulterae*, preferring to use another text which seems to have had some readings perhaps connected with Tatian."

If, however, Mr Lake was disappointed in not finding as close a connexion as he anticipated between the main body of the text of Ev. 211 and the Ferrar-group, he was successful in proving that two other MSS. which he examined were primary members of the group. The two MSS. in question are preserved in the library at Grotta Ferrata: one of them has already been alluded to in these pages, viz. Cod. 826 in Gregory's Catalogue. But Mr Lake shows that Cod. 828 is a companion text, that both codices "possessed (1) the transpositions of Jo. vii. 53—viii. 11 to Lc. xxi. 38, and Lc. xxii. 43, 44 to Mt. xxvi. 39; (2) the reading $\bar{\omega}$ *μνηστευθείσα παρθένος Μαριάμ ἐγέννησεν ἰὼ τὸν λεγόμενον $\chi\bar{\nu}$* , otherwise only found in 346 and 543; (3) the addition *καὶ ἐν τῷ προσεύχασθαι αὐτοῦς* in Mc. ix. 3 and all the other passages quoted [in my lecture] except in Jo. xx. 20 where 828 agreed with the T.R.; (4) the subscriptions" [in the Ferrar form, with numbered *ῥήματα* and *στίχοι*]. The menology in either case shows Calabrian traces. Mr Lake's researches bring the Ferrar-group into the form denoted by

13—69—124—346—543—788—826—828.

Observe the point that has been reached in the determination of the geographical origin of these codices: of the eight mentioned five are already traced to a Calabro-Sicilian origin; of the remaining three one is under critical suspicion of an Italian origin (the Leicester Codex), the other two are from Epirus or near it; Cod. 543 was purchased at Janina in Epirus, and Cod. 788 came into the National Library at Athens from the Monastery *τῶν μεγάλων πυλῶν* or *δουσικοῦ*, which, according to Gregory, is in Thessaly on the borders of Epirus. Of this last MS. Gregory says expressly, "In Calabria exaratus, jubente ut videtur Leone." The two on which light is needed are therefore the Leicester Codex and the Burdett-Coutts MS.; between these two, as we shall see presently, there is a close nexus. Let us tabulate the geographical results already reached, adding the date of the MS., and the reason for its local assignment: we have

Cod. 13—Saec. xiii—Calabro-Sicilian saints (Martin).
Cod. 69— " xv—unknown.

- Cod. 124—Saec. xii—brought to Vienna from Naples by John Sambucus (Martin).
 Cod. 346— „ xii—purchased at Gallipoli in 1606: Calabro-Sicilian saints
 (Martin).
 Cod. 543— „ xii—purchased at Janina in Epirus.
 Cod. 788— „ xi—written in Calabria (Gregory).
 Cod. 826— „ xii—Calabro-Sicilian saints (Lake).
 Cod. 828— „ xii—Calabro-Sicilian saints (Lake).

It will be convenient also, for purposes of reference, to tabulate roughly the tracts which are found attached to some of these Calabrian MSS.:

1. Explanation of the Creed and the principal Councils, Cod. 69.
2. Lives of Apostles, 69, 346.
3. Limits of Patriarchates, 69, 211, 346, 543.
4. Climates of Africa, 211, 346, 543.
5. Appearances of Christ at Resurrection, 211, 346.
6. Symbols of four Evangelists, 124, 211, 346.
7. Concerning the Angels, 211, 346.
8. Nicene rules for Easter, 211.
9. Questions and Answers on Scripture, 211.

Under (3) it is to be observed that the order of the Patriarchates is as follows:

Jerusalem, Rome, Constantinople, Alexandria, Antioch, according to 69, 211, 346, 543,

but in the tract ascribed to Leo Sapiens in Migne *PG* (tom. 107), from which the Abbé Martin thought the extract taken, it is

Rome, Constantinople, Alexandria, Antioch, Jerusalem;

and in the similar tract ascribed to Nilus Doxapatrius in Migne *PG* (tom. 132)

Antioch, Rome, Alexandria, Constantinople, Jerusalem.

We have now brought together all the data that have hitherto been collected for the study of the Ferrar-group, and may take up the question afresh with the view of still further extending our knowledge.